

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Tuesday, May 14, 2024 at 1:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 1:03 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Andrew Doud

Lee Finkel

Alan Sehoyan

Lorna Straus

Staff: Gary Rentrop, Richard Neumann

ABSENT

Nancy Porter

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Approval of Minutes

a. April 9, 2024 Minutes

Motion to approve as written with caveat to check recording and present at next meeting.

Motion made by Sehoyan, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus

V. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve as amended. Rentrop letter will not be in closed session. Rentrop explained that since it is attorney client privilege they can choose to waive the privilege and discuss, or place on file.

Doud would like to add the discussion of retaining a resource for the greater good in Staff Report, prior to Demolition Discussion.

Motion made by Sehoan, Seconded by Doud.
Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus

VI. Correspondence

- a. Professional Opinion Letter from Jennifer Metz, Past Perfect, re: Red House Demolition

Doud stated that the two forms of demolition referred to in the letter have never been done on the island. Doud also stated that Metz stated the 2x4's likely came from Old Mill Creek, which Doud stated was not in existence at the time of the construction of the house.

Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Sehoan, Seconded by Finkel.
Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus

- b. Professional Opinion Letter from Rentrop

It was decided not to waive the attorney client privilege and instead just place on file.

Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Sehoan.
Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus

VII. Committee Reports

None

VIII. Staff Report

- a. MD24-011-018(H) McGreevy 2nd floor Deck Board Replacement

Dombroski stated the applicant would like to replace the deck like for like. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Sehoan.
Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus

b. Greater Good Discussion

Doud lead a discussion on approving demolition based on the finding that it is for the greater good of the community. Examples of this being done in the past are Mackinac House, Mr. B's, Kay Hoppenrath House, and Ira Green's bike shop. Doud stated every demolition situation is different and he thinks it very important that it remains ours (the HDC) and the lawyers don't make the decisions. Rentrop stated the finding of facts make the decision.

IX. Old Business

a. May Residence Demolition by Neglect Discussion

Dombroski stated that he and Caroline May talked and corresponded. Dombroski handed out their email. May stated she spoke to Matt Schwabb and he said he could provide beams by the end of June for the front porch until they could do the complete job. May stated they have been speaking to realtors and surveyors because they would like to sell the house. They hope to sell this season. When asked by Finkel if ok Dombroski stated something should be done sooner rather than later because if left in disrepair it could do more damage to the house. Dombroski is ok with getting shoring up so it minimizes the potential of the porch falling off. The commission agreed May can work with Dennis to shore up the home. Her current permit is good through June of 2024. Motion by Doud to allow two months to shore up the building. May stated she has not set a specific date with the contractor. Doud stated that by June 30 the porch should be shored up. If in July it hasn't happened it will come back to the HDC. Doud withdrew his motion since there is an open permit

b. Education Segment Discussion

Motion to postpone until June.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Sehoan.
Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus

c. HB24-041-016 Jaquiss Demolition

Rentrop reminded the Commission that they are under the 60 day time clock which expires this month. Doud pointed out the fact that the original application was submitted four months before it became a one building HDC. Murray stated that his findings for the greater good are: eliminating the existing boarding house, reducing density, avoiding a hotel in favor of a single family home, the architects state the new house design complies, the placement of the house and proportions are identical to the existing, the windows and doors are similar, they intend to save as many 2x4's as possible to reuse. Ryan Spencer from Dickinson Homes addressed the Commission and stated they have some ideas for the new house like using a boom truck to bring the front facade back to Dickinson Homes to restore and use as much as possible. They could send engineers to come take dimensions to replicate, or if and

when they tear down the house bring back as many 2x4's as possible to reuse. They also could place a plaque on the fence showing what was preserved. Neumann stated that short of it becoming a hospital or community facility, how can it be good to remove a historic resource that has been identified as a historic site that contributes to the patrimony and ambience of the historic district as well as the significance of Mackinac Island as a whole. The first 5' would be replicated and everything behind that would be a different design. Straus stated that the island is based on a tourist economy. History is what we live on, what we sell, and what people come to the island to see. Straus is not in favor of demolition of any building. Straus further said we as a HDC have a responsibility to maintain that history. Cheryl Jaquiss stated she hopes the HDC approves her application today, but if not it will regretfully be in someones else's hands in the court of law. Audience member, Mary Dufina, asked Jacquiss a direct question about re-zoning.

Motion by Doud to deny demolition and the replica, pending City Councils opinion. After Discussion Doud rescinded his motion.

Motion by Doud, second by Sehoyan to allow the demolition and the replica pending City Council approval. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Sehoyan Nays: Finkel, Straus. Motion fails.

Motion by Straus, second by Finkel to deny the demolition of the historic red house building on Mackinac Island. Roll call vote: Ayes: Finkel, Straus. Nays: Doud, Sehoyan. Motion fails.

Sehoyan asked Ryan from Dickinson the details on what he is proposing. Ryan stated they would take it apart and try to re-fabricate or replicate the facade.

Motion by Sehoyan, second by Doud to approve the demolition of the red house with the caveat that the Dickinson Homes can replicate/restore as much as possible of the façade as set forth with the rest of the plans that have already been presented, the pre-existing demolition application, and for the best interest of the community, that because the government must demonstrate that there is articulate standards of conduct with your action with sufficient justification. And that requires that when a application for a permit to demolish is beginning, that there were not sufficient demonstrated articulate standards to deny that act. In addition to treat people in a fair fashion up front with demonstrated standards. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Sehoyan, Finkel, Straus. All in favor. Motion carries. During the roll call vote Rentrop was asked by Straus to restate the Motion. Rentrop provided a summary that differed from the language of Sehoyan's Motion, and Straus then voted Aye. Rentrops summary stated Motion to approve the demolition with the findings being that the items enumerated and set forth in the minutes that the front façade will be preserved and if not able to be preserved, replicated, and that the house is going to be a single family residence and that the house has been in the family for 60 years and was originally intended as a hotel and has been used for employee housing and now seeks to use if for single family residence for their personal use.

X. New Business

- a. East End Mission Historic District Letter to Property Owners

Motion to table.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Sehojan.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehojan, Straus

- b. Demolition Application Discussion

Motion to table.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Sehojan.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehojan, Straus

- c. Discussion Regarding Minutes Being Reviewed by Attorney

Motion to table.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Sehojan.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehojan

- d. R124-042-021(H) Bayview New Egress Window

Steve Rilenge stated Mr. Yoder is trying to put in a bedroom and needs an egress window. everything else on outside will stay the same. The center window is lower to meet egress. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Sehojan, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehojan, Straus

XI. Public Comment

None.

XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn 3:31PM.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Sehojan.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehojan, Straus

Lee Finkel, Chairman

Katie Pereny, Secretary